Management of Gray Mold of Iceberg Lettuce by Biological Control Agents and Chitosan Formulations

R. G. A. S. Rajapakse¹, M. P. T. Premaratna¹, Shyamalee Kohombange¹*, D. G. N. S. B. Jayasinghe¹, H. A. S. Rohana¹, H. G. Gunathilake¹, K. R. C. de Silva² and A. K. Rathnayake²

¹Horticultural Crops Research and Development Institute, Gannoruwa, Peradeniya, Sri Lanka. ²Atomic Energy Board of Sri Lanka, Colombo, Sri Lanka.

Authors’ contributions
This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. Author RGASR designed the study, wrote the protocol and first draft. Author MPTP developed the formulation of bio control agents and conducted laboratory studies. Author SK done the statistical analysis and preparation of final draft. Authors DGNSBJ, HASR and HGG conducted field survey and field studies. Authors KRCS and AKR develop the formulations of chitopower 1 and 2. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information
DOI: 10.9734/AJAAR/2019/v11i230051
Editor(s): (1) Dr. Saad Farouk Mohamed Hussiien Gadalla, Professor, Department of Agricultural Botany, Faculty of Agriculture, Mansoura University, Egypt. Reviewers: (1) Andrei Ana-Maria, Research Development Institute for Plant Protection, Romania. (2) M. M. V. Baig, Yeshwant Mahavidyalay, India. Complete Peer review History: https://sdiarticle4.com/review-history/52200

Received 08 August 2019
Accepted 23 October 2019
Published 01 November 2019

ABSTRACT
Gray mold caused by Botrytis is the major problem in iceberg lettuce cultivation in poly tunnels in Sri Lanka. Currently management of this disease of lettuce depends mainly on foliar application of fungicides. Continues application of fungicides for control of gray mold could not be recommended as lettuce mainly consume as fresh vegetables. Therefore, studies were conducted to identify the causal agent, varietal resistance to pathogen and effective chitosan formulation and biological control agents on control of gray mold diseases of ice berg lettuce in poly tunnels. Causal agent of this disease was identified as Botrytis cinerea. Commercially grown varieties Eden and Maruli were equally susceptible to the disease. Different isolates of pathogen were shown different virulence levels on iceberg lettuce variety Eden. In vitro test showed that, almost complete inhibition
of mycelia growth of all *Botrytis* isolates at 600 ppm chitopower 2 and liquid formulation of *Trichoderma asperellum* (4x10⁵ conidia/ml) but 600 ppm chitopower 1 or liquid formulation of fluorescent *Pseudomonas* (10⁶ bacteria/ml) or fungicide-Dicloran 75WP (3000ppm) were suppressed some isolates only. Studies in poly tunnel showed that lowest disease severity index (3.6% DSI) of gray mold in iceberg lettuce plants treated with *Trichoderma asperellum* and highest DSI (77.7%) in control treatment. Dicloran 75WP, chitopower 2 and fluorescent *Pseudomonas* were recorded 16.6%, 18.5% and 46.2% DSI respectively. Results revealed that *Trichoderma asperellum* bio control agent and chitopower 2 could be used as alternatives to synthetic fungicides in controlling of gray mold disease of iceberg lettuce grown in poly tunnels.

**Keywords:** Biological control; chitosan; gray mold; fungicide.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Gray mold disease is become an epidemic level of iceberg lettuce cultivations especially in polytunnels in Sri Lanka. Currently management of gray mold disease of crops depends mainly on foliar application of fungicides. Several fungicides like Azoxystrobin, Chlorothalonil, Mancozeb, Pyraclostrobin, Thiophenate Methyl and Captan are used in Sri Lanka to control the disease by farmers. Farmers, however, claimed that application of fungicides is not effective when symptoms have developed in cool and humid condition in poly tunnels (Personal communication with growers).

*Botrytis cinerea* is causal agent of gray mold of lettuce in poly tunnels in Sri Lanka [1]. They also revealed that continuous foliar spraying of 4 g/l concentrations of fungicide, Dicloran 75 WP were reduced the gray mold of lettuce. However, continues application of fungicides for control of gray mold disease could not be recommended as lettuce mainly consume as fresh vegetables. Chitosan a natural biodegradable de-acetylated form of chitin has been proven to control numerous pre and post-harvest disease on various horticultural commodities [2,3,4,5]. It has reported that chitosan induces a series of defense reactions in plants correlated with enzymatic activities and also it has a direct effect on microbes by fungistatic or fungicidal potential [6,7]. Efficacy of the different chitosan compounds on growth inhibition of fungal pathogen such as *Colletotrichum* and *Fusarium* species was demonstrated by in vitro test [8]. It has been reported that chitosan has a grater inhibitory effect on Kiwi fruit gray mold [9] and almost complete inhibition of *Botrytis* conidia germination (*in vitro*) and controlled the gray mould of cucumber caused by *B. cinerea* by chitosan [10]. There was several research reports indicated that selected strains of biological control agents *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Trichoderma* species had significantly reduced lesion areas on whole lettuce plants caused by *Botrytis cinerea* [11,12,13]. It has been reported that *Trichoderma harzianum* control *Botrytis cinerea* and many other fungi by acquiring induce systemic resistance of plants and antagonism of nutrient activated conidia against *Botrytis cinerea* [14,12,15,16]. Similarly it has been demonstrated that antifungal activity of *Pseudomonas antimicrobica* by inhibiting conidia germination and outgrowth of *Botrytis cinerea* [17,13]. Application of agro-chemicals are the major plant protection method over decades even though they are associated with many disadvantages including their expensive applications, environmental pollution and human health hazards due to excessive usage. This has emerged a worldwide huge trend to explore other environmental friendly alternative methods for plant protection. Therefore, the objectives of this study were to identify the causal agent of grey mold disease, resistance varieties and effective chitosan formulations and biological control agents on control of gray mold of iceberg lettuce in poly tunnels.

### 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### 2.1 Pathogen Isolation and Identification

Disease samples of Iceberg lettuce were collected from poly tunnels in hill country Nuwara Eliya area. Pathogen was isolated from lesions of disease affected leaves of iceberg lettuce on Potato Dextrose Agar (PDA). Single spore isolates of pathogen were prepared from mycelia of single conidia cultures grown on PDA. Pathogen was identified on the basis of microscopic observations of size and shape of conidia, mycelia arrangements, culture morphology on PDA and comparison with published data [11,18]. Five isolates of *Botrytis* was selected for further studies and mycelia
growth rate on PDA and conidial diameter of each isolate was measured at 7 days after inoculation. The isolates of pathogen were cultured on PDA slant and stored for further studies.

2.2 Pathogenicity of Botrytis Isolates on Iceberg Lettuce

Pathogenicity of all isolates was tested by wound inoculation with conidia suspension and subsequent symptoms development on leaves. Five isolates of Botrytis obtained from diseased plants and iceberg lettuce plants of variety Eden was used for the pathogenicity test. One month old lettuce plants grown in poly tunnel under 18-26°C temperature and 85-90% relative humidity were inoculated with isolates of Botrytis by pin prink methods using conidia suspension (10^6 conidia/ml) of different isolates of Botrytis. Five iceberg lettuce plants were used to inoculate each Botrytis isolate. Un-inoculated plants were served as control. Disease symptoms were observed after 5 days of inoculation and re-isolation of pathogen was done on PDA medium to perform Koch postulation [11,19].

2.3 Response of Iceberg Lettuce Varieties to Infection of Botrytis Isolates

Experiment was conducted in poly tunnel (16-28°C, 80-90% relative humidity) at Dolosbage area (WU1) in Kandy District, Sri Lanka. Two commercially grown iceberg lettuce varieties Eden (V1) and Maruli (V2) and five Botrytis isolates (Br, Bs, Bl, Bp and Bt) were used for inoculation with lettuce varieties. Experimental design was completely Randomized design with two factor factorial. One month old iceberg lettuce plants of both varieties were inoculated with conidia suspension (10^6 conidia/ml) of different Botrytis isolates using pin prick method to observe subsequent symptoms development on plants. Disease severity of gray mold in iceberg lettuce varieties was measured using rating scale at harvest [20]. Symptoms of leaf tissue were evaluated according to Disease Severity Index of 0-4, where 0=no disease, 1=1-12% rot, 2=13-25%, 3=26-50%, 4=51-100%. The data obtained were tabulated and analyzed subjected to the analysis of variance procedure of SAS 9.1 software. Duncan's Multiple Range Test was performed to compare the differences among treatment means at p=0.05.

2.4 Effect of Biological Control Agents, Chitosan Formulations and Fungicide (Dicloran 75WP) on Mycelia Growth of Botrytis Isolates (in vitro)

Studies (in vitro) were conducted with the treatments of two formulations of chitosan i.e. Chitopower 1 (600ppm), chitopower 2 (600ppm) developed by Sri Lanka Atomic Energy Board and two biological control agents developed by Horticultural Crops Research and Development Institute, Sri Lanka i.e. liquid formulation of Trichoderma asperellum (4x10^5 conidia/ml) and fluorescent Pseudomonas (1x10^6 bacteria/ml) and fungicide- Dicloran 75WP (3000ppm). Untreated plants were served as control. Five isolates of Botrytis were used for each study. Experimental procedure was Completely Randomized Design and each treatment replicated five times. Effectiveness of Chitopower 1, Chitopower 2 and fungicide Dicloran 75WP in controlling mycelia growth of Botrytis isolates was measured by culturing them on amended PDA medium. Effectiveness of biological control agents in controlling mycelia growth of Botrytis isolates was measured by duel culture techniques on PDA medium. All PDA plates were incubated at 28°C for 7 days. Percent inhibition of fungi (growth reduction over control) was calculated by the following equation.

\[ I = \frac{100(C-T)}{C} \]

Where I is the % inhibition of mycelia growth, C is the growth of fungus in control plate (mm) and T is the growth of fungus on the treated plate (mm).

2.5 Effect of Biological Control Agents, Chitopower 2 and Fungicide Dicloran 75WP on Gray Mold of Iceberg Lettuce Grown in Poly Tunnel

Experiment was conducted in poly tunnels at Dolosbage area (WU1) in Kandy District, Sri Lanka. Mean day and night temperature in the location was 23°C and 16°C respectively. RH was over 90% throughout the day. Iceberg lettuce variety Eden was used for experiment.

Plants were established in pots and standard crop management practices were done throughout the study. Top of the areal part of each iceberg plants were artificially inoculated with conidial suspension (10^6 conidia/ml) of most virulent Botrytis isolate Bl by pin prink method.
3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Gray mold symptoms were observed in iceberg lettuce plants grown in poly tunnels at Nuwara Eliya area in Sri Lanka. The symptoms observed were water-soaked, brown or gray blight and abundant mycelia with conidia were appeared on the infected leaves. Isolates of Botrytis were identified by comparison of their colony morphology on PDA, microscopically observations of size, shape of conidia and mycelia arrangements with published data [18].

The fungus produced light gray to gray colonies with dark mycelium and abundant conidia on PDA at 26°C for 7 days. It was observed that significant variation of mycelia growth rate of different isolates on PDA. The conidia of all isolates were one-celled, ovoid in shape, dark brown, and average size of conidia of different isolates was varied from 12-14x9-11 μm. Identification of Botrytis cinerea was from its typical spore and conidiophores structure. Willets, 1997 reported that conidiophores are specialized structure that incorporates a terminal cluster of synchronously produced conidia, borne on a well-developed conidiogenous hypha, which resembles a bunch of grapes. Primary cultures of isolates on PDA have a light grey at first, later becoming grey or grayish-brown (Table 1) with dark walled erect septate hyphae. The dark coloured mature conidiophores, which branch alternately. This conformed to the description of Botrytis cinerea [18].

To determine the pathogenicity test, conidial suspension (1x10^6 conidia/ml) was inoculated with iceberg lettuce plants variety Eden by pin prink methods and allow to grow in poly tunnel (18-26°C, 85-90% relative humidity). After 5 days, grey mold symptoms similar to the original symptoms were developed on inoculated plant leaves. The fungal pathogen was re-isolated from the disease lesions of the inoculated plants and the re-isolated pathogen exhibited the same morphological characteristics as those of the original isolates. Thus, the isolates of fungal pathogen fulfilled the criteria stipulated by the Koch’s postulates and were identified as the causal agent of the gray mold on iceberg lettuce plants.

Variatel response of iceberg lettuce to different isolates of Botrytis showed that there were significant variations of percent disease severity index (DSI%) among Botrytis isolates (Table 2). Both iceberg lettuce varieties Eden and Maruli were equally susceptible to all Botrytis isolates. However, Botrytis isolate-B1 could be considered as most virulent isolates as it had the highest DSI on both iceberg varieties compared other isolates.

Study (in vitro) was conducted to identify the effect of two chitosan formulations (chitopower 1 and Chitopower 2), two biological control agents (formulation of Trichoderma asperellum and fluorescent Pseudomonas) and fungicide-Dicloran 75WP (3000ppm) on growth of different isolates of Botrytis on PDA (Table 3).

Results revealed that chitopower 2 (600ppm) and Trichoderma asperellum bio-control agent completely suppressed mycelia growth of all tested isolates of Botrytis (in vitro) (Table 3). Biological control agent fluorescent Pseudomonas also completely suppressed most virulent Botrytis isolate i.e. B1 and other two isolates Br and Bp. Chitopower 1 (600ppm) completely suppressed only Br and Bp i.e. less virulent isolates on both iceberg lettuce varieties.
Table 1. Characteristic of fungal isolates of *Botrytis* collected from leaves of infected plants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><em>Botrytis</em> isolates</th>
<th>Colony colour on PDA at 7 DAI</th>
<th>Colony diameter on PDA at 7 DAI</th>
<th>Average size of conidia (µm)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bs</td>
<td>Light gray at first, later Grey, reverse black,</td>
<td>5.6&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>12x9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bp</td>
<td>Grey at first, later grayish-brown, reverse black</td>
<td>9.2&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>13x9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bt</td>
<td>Grey at first, later grayish-brown, reverse black</td>
<td>9.2&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>14x11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br</td>
<td>Light gray at first, later gray, reverse black</td>
<td>6.4&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>13x10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bl</td>
<td>Grey at first, later grayish-brown, reverse black</td>
<td>9.1&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>13x9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Means with the same letter(s) on the column are not significantly different at P= 0.05 please indicate the LSD value*

Table 2. Mean Disease Severity Index (DSI %) of grey mold of lettuce varieties inoculated with different isolates of botrytis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Varieties</th>
<th>Disease severity index (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Br</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V1</td>
<td>17.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V2</td>
<td>12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>14.8&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Means with the same letter(s) are not significantly different at P = 0.05 please indicate the LSD value; V1 & V2: lettuce variety Eden and Maruli; Br, Bs, Bl, Bp & Bt: different Botrytis isolates*

Table 3. Effect of chitopower 1, chitopower 2, *Trichoderma asperellum*, fluorescent *Pseudomonas* and fungicide- Dicloran 75WP on mycelia growth of *Botrytis* isolates *(In vitro test)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><em>Botrytis</em> isolate</th>
<th>Growth reduction % of <em>Botrytis</em> isolates on PDA at 7 DAI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>600ppm Chitopower 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Br</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bt</td>
<td>83.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bl</td>
<td>54.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bs</td>
<td>94.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bp</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It has been reported that almost complete inhibition of *Botrytis* conidia germination was found, in vitro by chitosan molecule which is similar to chitopower 2 but not with chitosan oligomers which is similar to chitopower 1 [10]. They also reported that chitosan controlled the grey mould caused by *Botrytis cinerea* compared with control but chitin oligomers did not show any effect on disease control. They further concluded that although a dual mode of action was involved in the control of grey mould by chitosan, the antifungal activity of the compound was an essential factor. It was evident that the induction of the defense response without the antifungal activity was not enough to suppress the diseases. Therefore, chitopower 2 (600ppm), *Trichoderma asperellum* and fluorescent *Pseudomonas* was selected to identify the effective and environmental friendly disease control practice for grey mold of iceberg lettuce grown in poly tunnels.

The lowest yield loss was observed in *Trichoderma asperellum* treated pots while highest yield loss was observed in control pots (Table 4). It has been reported that *Trichoderma* strains exert bio control against fungal pathogens either indirectly by competing for nutrients and space, modifying the environmental conditions or promoting plant growth and plant defensive mechanisms and antibiosis or directly by mechanisms such as mycoparasitism [21].
Table 4. Mean Disease Severity Index % of treatments and percentage yield loss compared to most efficient treatment when iceberg lettuce plants (var. Eden) treated with chitopower 2, biological control agents *Trichoderma asperellum* and fluorescent *Pseudomonas* and fungicide Dichloran 75WP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatments</th>
<th>Mean DSI (%) of gray mold</th>
<th>Percentage yield loss compared to most effective treatment (T1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T1 - <em>Trichoderma asperellum</em></td>
<td>3.6&lt;sup&gt;ab&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2 - fluorescent <em>Pseudomonas</em></td>
<td>46.2&lt;sup&gt;bc&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3 - Chitopower 2</td>
<td>18.5&lt;sup&gt;bc&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4 - Dichloran 75WP</td>
<td>16.6&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T5 - Control</td>
<td>77.7&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Means with the same letter(s) are not significantly different at P = 0.05 please indicate the LSD value

Chitopower 2 and fungicide Dichloran 75 WP treated plots also recorded comparatively lower DSI (%) and yield losses (Table 4). Low molecular weight chitosan has a greater inhibitory effect on Kiwi fruit gray mold due to induction of accumulation of higher levels of hydrogen peroxide, greater level of activity of several defense-related enzymes, greater ability to penetrate the cell walls in kiwifruit epidermal peel tissue and activate a greater defense response [9]. Similarly the low molecular weight chitosan which was used to produce Chitopower 2 formulation showed remarkable disease control ability of gray mold of iceberg lettuce. Ben Shalon et al., 2003 reported that almost complete inhibition of *Botrytis* conidia germination (in vitro) and controlled the gray mould of cucumber caused by *B. cinerea* by chitosan [10]. Results in DSI and yield loss data indicated that gray mold of iceberg lettuce was effectively controlled by spraying of liquid formulation of *Trichoderma asperellum* bio control agent as well as chitopower 2 starting from early crop growth stage and continuing up to harvesting stage with 7 days intervals.

4. CONCLUSION

Causal agent of gray mold of iceberg lettuce in poly tunnels was re-conformed as *Botrytis cinerea*. Commercially grown varieties Eden and Maruli were equally susceptible to disease. Almost complete inhibition of mycelia growth of all *Botrytis* isolates was found, in vitro, at 600 ppm chitopower 2 and liquid formulation of *Trichoderma asperellum*. Gray mold of iceberg lettuce caused by *Botrytis cinerea* in poly tunnels was effectively controlled by spraying of liquid formulation of *Trichoderma asperellum* bio control agent as well as Chitopower 2, starting from early crop growth stage and continuing up to harvesting stage with 7 days intervals.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES


© 2019 Rajapakse et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.